



## Notice of meeting of

#### **Decision Session - Executive Leader**

**To:** Councillor Waller (Executive Leader)

**Date:** Tuesday, 1 February 2011

**Time:** 3.45 pm

**Venue:** The Guildhall, York

## **AGENDA**

## Notice to Members - Calling In

Members are reminded that, should they wish to call in any item on this agenda, notice must be given to Democracy Support Group by:

**10.00am on Monday 31 January 2011** if an item is called in before a decision is taken, or

**4.00pm on Thursday 3 February 2011** if an item is called in after a decision has been taken.

Items called in will be considered by the Scrutiny Management Committee.

Written representations in respect of items on this agenda should be submitted to Democratic Services by **5.00pm on Friday 28 January 2011.** 

#### 1. Declarations of Interest

At this point Members are asked to declare any personal or prejudicial interests they may have in the business on this agenda.



**2. Minutes** (Pages 3 - 6)

To approve and sign the minutes of the meeting held on Tuesday 7 December 2010.

## 3. Public Participation

At this point in the meeting, members of the public who have registered their wish to speak at the meeting can do so. The deadline for registering is **5:00pm on Monday 31 January** 2011.

Members of the public may register to speak on:-

- an item on the agenda;
- an issue within the Executive Member's remit;
- an item that has been published on the Information Log since the last session. Information reports are listed at the end of the agenda.

# 4. Revenue Budget Estimates 2011/12 - (Pages 7 - 26) Office of the Chief Executive

This report presents the 2011-12 budget proposals for the Office of the Chief Executive and also includes savings proposals relating to Strategic Housing which is part of Communities & Neighbourhoods Directorate but is the Executive Leader's responsibility. The Executive Leader is asked to consider and comment on the budget proposals included in this report and identify their recommendations which will be considered by the Executive as part of the consultation exercise at its meeting on 15 February 2011.

# 5. Revenue Budget Estimates 2011/12 - (Pages 27 - 46) Economy & Asset Management

This report presents the 2011-12 budget proposals for Economy and Asset Management. The Executive Leader is asked to consider and comment on the budget proposals included in this report and identify their recommendations which will be considered by the Executive as part of the consultation exercise at its meeting on 15 February 2011.

## 6. Update on Green Jobs

(Pages 47 - 60)

This report seeks to provide an update on actions taken following the report produced by the Green Jobs taskforce.

## 7. Urgent Business

Any other business which the Chair considers urgent under the Local Government Act 1972

## **Information Reports**

No information items have appeared on the Information Log since the last meeting.

## **Democracy Officers**

Catherine Clarke and Louise Cook (job share) Contact details:

- Telephone (01904) 551031
- Email <u>catherine.clarke@york.gov.uk</u> and louise.cook@york.gov.uk

(If contacting by email, please send to both Democracy officers named above).

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democracy Officer responsible for servicing this meeting:

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports

Contact details are set out above.



## **About City of York Council Meetings**

#### Would you like to speak at this meeting?

If you would, you will need to:

- register by contacting the Democracy Officer (whose name and contact details can be found on the agenda for the meeting) no later than 5.00 pm on the last working day before the meeting;
- ensure that what you want to say speak relates to an item of business on the agenda or an issue which the committee has power to consider (speak to the Democracy Officer for advice on this);
- find out about the rules for public speaking from the Democracy Officer.

A leaflet on public participation is available on the Council's website or from Democratic Services by telephoning York (01904) 551088

#### Further information about what's being discussed at this meeting

All the reports which Members will be considering are available for viewing online on the Council's website. Alternatively, copies of individual reports or the full agenda are available from Democratic Services. Contact the Democracy Officer whose name and contact details are given on the agenda for the meeting. Please note a small charge may be made for full copies of the agenda requested to cover administration costs.

#### **Access Arrangements**

We will make every effort to make the meeting accessible to you. The meeting will usually be held in a wheelchair accessible venue with an induction hearing loop. We can provide the agenda or reports in large print, electronically (computer disk or by email), in Braille or on audio tape. Some formats will take longer than others so please give as much notice as possible (at least 48 hours for Braille or audio tape).

If you have any further access requirements such as parking close-by or a sign language interpreter then please let us know. Contact the Democracy Officer whose name and contact details are given on the order of business for the meeting.

Every effort will also be made to make information available in another language, either by providing translated information or an interpreter providing sufficient advance notice is given. Telephone York (01904) 551550 for this service.

যদি যথেষ্ট আগে থেকে জানানো হয় তাহলে অন্য কোন ভাষাতে তথ্য জানানোর জন্য সব ধরণের চেষ্টা করা হবে, এর জন্য দরকার হলে তথ্য অনুবাদ করে দেয়া হবে অথবা একজন দোভাষী সরবরাহ করা হবে। টেলিফোন নম্বর (01904) 551 550 ।

Yeteri kadar önceden haber verilmesi koşuluyla, bilgilerin terümesini hazırlatmak ya da bir tercüman bulmak için mümkün olan herşey yapılacaktır. Tel: (01904) 551 550

我們竭力使提供的資訊備有不同語言版本,在有充足時間提前通知的情況下會安排筆譯或口譯服務。電話 (01904) 551 550。

Informacja może być dostępna w tłumaczeniu, jeśli dostaniemy zapotrzebowanie z wystarczającym wyprzedzeniem. Tel: (01904) 551 550

#### **Holding the Executive to Account**

The majority of councillors are not appointed to the Executive (40 out of 47). Any 3 non-Executive councillors can 'call-in' an item of business from a published Executive (or Executive Member Decision Session) agenda. The Executive will still discuss the 'called in' business on the published date and will set out its views for consideration by a specially convened Scrutiny Management Committee (SMC). That SMC meeting will then make its recommendations to the next scheduled Executive meeting in the following week, where a final decision on the 'called-in' business will be made.

#### **Scrutiny Committees**

The purpose of all scrutiny and ad-hoc scrutiny committees appointed by the Council is to:

- Monitor the performance and effectiveness of services;
- Review existing policies and assist in the development of new ones, as necessary; and
- Monitor best value continuous service improvement plans

#### Who Gets Agenda and Reports for our Meetings?

- Councillors get copies of all agenda and reports for the committees to which they are appointed by the Council;
- Relevant Council Officers get copies of relevant agenda and reports for the committees which they report to;
- Public libraries get copies of **all** public agenda/reports.

City of York Council	Committee Minutes
MEETING	DECISION SESSION - EXECUTIVE LEADER
DATE	7 DECEMBER 2010
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS WALLER (EXECUTIVE MEMBER)

#### 16. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Executive Leader was invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal or prejudicial interests he might have in the business on the agenda. He declared he had none.

#### 17. MINUTES

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the last meeting of the Decision Session of the Executive Leader, held on 5 October 2010 be approved and signed by the Executive Leader as a correct record.

#### 18. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

It had been reported that there had been one registration to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

A representative spoke on item 5 "Job Connect Clifton" – a project to tackle worklessness. He informed the Executive Leader that he felt this was an excellent initiative and good for the community. He expressed how it can be difficult for some people, such as, single parents, the older aged residents and people who suffer mental health issues to find work and organise their life's around it. He thanked officers for the work they had already done in the area and he felt this initiative was a great way to support and advise the local residents.

#### 19. BROADBAND COVERAGE IN THE CITY OF YORK

The Executive Leader consider a report that provided an update on broadband infrastructure provision in the City of York and to set a strategic aim for businesses in the City to have broadband connections with speeds of at least 20Mbps by 2012.

Officers gave an update and confirmed they:

- were continuing to work with other parties interested in providing super-fast broadband in the City.
- had a positive working relationship with all the interested parties.
- were maintaining and facilitating the provision.
- were identifying any potential gaps and would work with other parties to address these gaps.
- would continue to liaise with Fibrecity.

In answer to the Leaders questions officers stated that they had received a positive response from BT and Siemens were interested in supplying to the rural areas.

RESOLVED: That the Executive Leader requested officers:

- continue to work with other parties interested in providing super-fast broadband in the City where these proposals are believed to be realistic and deliverable, with an overall strategic objective for businesses being able to have broadband connections with speeds of at least 20Mpbs by 2012.
- ii. ensure work aligns with government objectives.
- iii. review potential funding streams that become available.
- iv. consult with residents and businesses.

Reason: To support the strategic objectives of the Sustainable Community Strategy and Corporate Strategy.

## 20. "JOB CONNECT CLIFTON" - A PROJECT TO TACKLE WORKLESSNESS

In response from a request from Members that officers consider ways of extending the successful work undertaken through the Kingsway West Action Project to other areas of disadvantage in the City, the Executive Leader considered a report that sets out a proposal, with funding through the Efficiency Programme (RIEP), to tackle worklessness in Clifton.

Officers thanked the representative for his comments and informed the Executive Leader that currently work was taking place in the Clifton area. In the last two months an Outreach worker from Future Prospects had been working at Clifton Health Centre along side GP's to connect with local residents to discuss local job opportunities and so far this had resulted in 10 referrals, with 5 applying for jobs.

Officers stated that two days a week a second Outreach worker worked from the Clifton Children's Centre and Burton Green Primary School. This outreach worker had spoken to 30 adults in the last month who were interested in working or setting up their own businesses.

A range of partner organisations had also been consulted and were actively engaged, particularly through Learning City Partnerships. Officers would also be attending the Year 9 options evening at Canon Lee School to offer advice to parents.

The Executive Leader thanked the team for the work they had done and for working through the funding cuts from Yorkshire Forward. He reminded officers that some individuals may need support to complete an application form and some may need advice on what to expect in an interview.

## Page 5

#### RESOLVED:

- i. That the "Job Connect Clifton" project to support local residents from specific priority groups into work be endorsed.
- ii. That any updates be reported to the Executive Leader with an end of project report brought back to the Executive Leader Decision Session.

Reason: To address fairness and inclusion issues in the city through a targeted approach to worklessness in a specific disadvantaged community.

Cllr Waller, Executive Leader [The meeting started at 4.15 pm and finished at 4.40 pm].

This page is intentionally left blank



#### **Decision Session of the Executive Leader**

1 February 2011

Joint Report of the Chief Executive and the Director of Customer and Business Support Services

# Revenue Budget Estimates 2011/12 – Office of the Chief Executive Purpose of Report

- This report presents the 2011/12 budget proposals for The Office of the Chief Executive. It includes:
  - The national context regarding local government funding and the implications for City of York Council
  - The approach that has been adopted to develop budget proposals
  - The outcomes of the customer budget consultation
  - the revenue budget for 2010/11 (Annex 1) to show the existing budgets
  - the budget adjusted and rolled forward from 2010/11 into 2011/12
  - the cost of pay and price increases and increments for the portfolio
  - proposals for service pressure costs and savings options for the portfolio area (Annexes 2 and 3).

The report also includes savings proposals relating to Strategic Housing which is part of Communities & Neighbourhoods Directorate but is the Executive Leader's responsibility.

- Budget Council will be held on 24 February 2011 and will make decisions on the overall budget for the Council. In order to facilitate the decision making process the Executive are meeting on 15 February 2011 to consider the recommendations identified by the individual portfolio Executive Members and the results of the consultation exercise.
- The Executive Leader is therefore asked to consider the budget proposals included in this report and identify their recommendations (after considering the proposals in annexes 2 and 3) which will be considered by the Executive as part of the consultation exercise. The Executive Leader is invited to provide comments on the budget proposals in this report.

#### **Background**

- The financial context for the 2011/12 budget has been significantly impacted by :-
  - Worldwide recession leading to Central Government deficit reduction plan
  - Unprecedented reductions in Public Sector spending

## Page 8

- At the same time we have unavoidable ongoing financial pressures arising from
  - Increasing number of older people, living longer and requiring care and support services for longer
  - An increase in the number of severely disabled children who require intensive support into and throughout adulthood
  - Reductions in income from Council services as people have less money to spend
  - o Reduction in funding of subsidised bus travel for older people
  - Increased cost of waste disposal
  - Impact of changes to Pensions and NI legislation.
- The Council's 2011/12 budget is being developed within the constraints of the extremely challenging financial climate, set out in the government's Spending Review and provisional finance settlement information. In particular:
  - a Total reductions in Government funding of 28% over the next 4 years, heavily frontloaded with CYC's grant being cut by 13.3% in 2011/12
  - b 22 grants, worth £14,403k in 2010/11 and with an indicative value of £11,478k in 2011/12, have been rolled into the formula grant.
  - c The increase in formula grant in the provisional settlement, including the grants transferred in, is only £5,183k, leaving a shortfall in funding of £9,221k between the two years.
  - d 23 grants, worth £8,200k in 2010/11, have been transferred to the new Early Intervention Grant, for which the council will receive £6,350k in 2011/12 a further shortfall of £1.850k.
  - e 21 grants, worth £13,685k in 2010/11, have been incorporated within the Dedicated Schools Grant (DSG). The provisional DSG for 2011/12 is £106,564k, an increase of £13,659k from the 2010/11 level (subject to pupil number adjustments).
  - f There are a further five grants (worth £759k in 2010/11) as yet still under review.
  - g Against these pressures Executive were advised in December that directorates would need to find savings of £15m to be able to set a balance budget for 2011/12.
  - h In addition, other grants (worth £5,554k in 2010/11) which formerly were direct grants to service areas have been cancelled, creating additional financial pressures in directorates.
  - i While the Council has been penalised over the past few years by the workings of the floors and ceilings within the formula grant mechanism, for 2011/12 this same process will offer the protection of a damping gain of £2,541k.

- j The Council will receive a further reduction in formula grant of £4,639k in 2012/13.
- Against these funding reductions the Council has been offered a sum of £1,828k per annum for each year of the Spending Review period if the council tax level in the area is frozen at the 2010/11 level. At the same time the threat of 'capping' local authorities who decide to raise council tax levels or net expenditure above a level yet to be determined by the government has not been removed. York currently has the second lowest Council Tax of all Unitary authorities.
- The 2010/11 revenue budget monitoring process has identified areas of activity that currently have insufficient capacity to deal with the increased demands on those services. In addition consideration has been given to the Councils top priorities, and the need to ensure that key front line areas of activity, particularly those in respect of adults and children, can continue to be provided. From this analysis, specific areas of investment will be proposed within the Councils 2011/12 budget, in particular within the following areas:
  - Increasing demand on adult social care services
  - Impact of economic downturn on the Council's income generating services
- The proposed budget for 2011/12 reflects the need to direct investment into these areas in order that planning and monitoring of service delivery and improvement can take place against an adequate resourcing platform.
- In addition, the Council recognises that adequate provision needs to be created within the budget to ensure that the continuing financial impact of the economic downturn can be contained effectively. Following detailed review of economic pressures both on front line services and the Council's Treasury Management function, it is proposed that money will be set aside within the budget to contain the impact of these pressures.
- In order to create the financial capacity to enable adequate investment in these priority areas the budget strategy has been based around certain key financial management principles. A fundamental maxim of the strategy is that Directorates have been made clearly responsible for the robust and effective self-management of their existing financial resources and that restraint has been expected in putting forward for additional growth in budget to be funded corporately.
- Directorates have been expected to contain their net expenditure within clearly defined and strictly enforced cash limits with a clear expectation that Directorates self manage all non-exceptional budget pressures within this cash limit. These pressures include the anticipated cost of the pay award and any incremental increases due in year. Explicitly linked to self-management within defined cash limits has been the requirement for directorates to demonstrate the re-allocation of budgets in order to contain internal financial pressures.
- 12 CYC has a strong track record of delivering Value for Money and initiated an innovative efficiency programme, More for York which is on track to deliver

## Page 10

£9m savings from the work undertaken in the current year so it is well placed to meet the financial challenges set out above.

#### **Budget Consultation**

As with previous years we have asked residents what services they value and where they would wish CYC to continue providing the levels of service they receive now and where they think we should reduce spending. This year steps were taken to reduce the cost of the Budget Consultation, due to the very nature of the consultation. Budget questions were included in Your City and available online. Residents were also able to give their views through a separate online budgeting tool - YouChoose. The consultation generated a statistically reliable response of 738 for Your City and 465 for YouChoose. Whilst the level of response is lower than last year the results remain statistically reliable, and furthermore overall spend was less than £1,000.

#### Your City Questions - This was based upon 3 questions:

- 60% of residents would choose to meet the budget challenge through higher fees and charges, 44% through reductions in service and only 30% of residents through increased Council Tax.
- People are more willing to pay increased charges for Planning, Parking and Leisure facilities than they are for Homecare services.
- In deciding whether budgets for different services should stay the same or be reduced, residents were more likely to say that funding for social care services, community safety and street based services should remain the same – 85% Children's social care, 75% crime prevention and community safety, 76% Adult social care, 76% waste and recycling, 74% road and footpath maintenance and 70% street cleaning.
- Residents were more willing to reduce spending on a broad range of leisure and culture services and on young peoples services and transport with 64% reducing sport and leisure facilities (including events and activities), 63% reducing theatres and museums, 47% reducing parks and open spaces, 45% reducing libraries, 42% reducing young peoples services and 41% reducing transport services.

You Choose Questionnaire - This was an interactive online tool that asked residents to identify how to make £15m savings by either increasing/decreasing Council Tax, spend or fees and charges on a range of services.

 Perhaps because residents were asked to identify total savings they were generally much more likely to reduce expenditure in all areas. However the same pattern of preference as in Your City was repeated with 98% of residents reducing the budget for Council support and public engagement, 92% reduced leisure and culture budgets, 89% reduced Adult Social Care budgets, 81% reduced Children's Social Care budgets whilst community safety was reduced by 74% of residents.  In terms of service efficiencies and saving money, respondents were very supportive of all the options. A review of the authority's fleet vehicles was supported by 82% of respondents, sharing services with partners by 78% and outsourcing services to external suppliers by 57%.

#### **Principles**

- Directorates have identified options for savings for consideration by the Executive portfolio holder based on 4 key principles. Each of these principles will bring benefits for the citizens of York, and each will be guide us as we tackle the realities of significant budgetary changes in the months and years to come:
  - **Create** opportunities for our citizens and communities, our businesses and educational establishments to prosper and thrive.

#### Protect

- The most vulnerable members of our community older people, people with disabilities and, children– by ensuring that the services with which we provide them are the very best possible
- All citizens by ensuring that vital Council services that secure their well-being continue to be delivered and that all customer groups receive equal outcomes
- The financial interests of our residents by not raising the amount of Council Tax they pay in 2011/12
- Staff by ensuring wherever possible that we provide security of employment .

#### Partner

- Increase public participation in decision-making and service delivery
- Bring together service provision from a range of agencies at a local level so that individuals, community groups and voluntary bodies can shape and prioritise and even take control of delivering services that are needed at a local level.
- With the voluntary and community sector; health services, and city partners in the police, fire service, education and business to join up services and make the most of all the resources within the city
- Cost and Quality of services are important to CYC where we cannot match both the cost and quality of service offered by other providers we will consider using the Community and Voluntary sector, staff co-operatives or the Private sector to deliver services.

#### Efficiency

- We will continue to monitor spend and drive costs down
- We will rationalise and reshape services to make them as efficient as possible
- Get better value from our non salary spend through effective procurement.

#### **Delivering the Savings**

Once again the More for York programme will be used to support the delivery of the savings. The programme will now be on a much larger scale and Directorate Management Teams will be central to delivery and managing the changes. It must be stressed that achievement of these efficiencies will not be easy to deliver but they are essential in order to deliver investment into priority areas. The scale and pace of the transformation process in coming years will be critical to the Council maintaining financial stability. In addition, clearly with the future pressures on public spending, combined with known forecast increased pressures in children's care, adult care, and waste management, the Council will face the need to both achieve significant transformational change, and review the overall type and level of service provision in coming years.

#### **Directorate Overview**

- In the Office of the Chief Executive we will continue to manage the procurement of goods and services, the council's Strategy Partnerships and Communications, manage the Councils' Business Change Programme and deliver corporate support for Performance Management and Business Intelligence, provide essential support services for all front line services.
- 17 The proposals within the budget aim to:

#### Create

 Jobs in the city by supporting the creation of an internal service to provide temporary staff which will reduce the cost of hiring external short term staff

#### **Protect**

Core services by streamlining all support services to ensure that they
deliver the best possible support to frontline services.

#### **Partner**

- Creating focussed prioritised relationships with partners that enable us to work closely together in future
- Support the setting up a trading company to provide support services to other Public Sector organisations and making savings as a result of economies of scale.

#### Efficiency

- Reduce the number of Managers at all levels across the organisation, saving £2.3m
- Rationalise and streamline all teams within Office of the Chief Executive Services
- Continue to reduce the cost of goods and services through commercial rigorous procurement to control demand and ensure the Council gets the

- best deals available from its non salary spend
- Reduce the cost of internal communications
- Consolidate customer consultation activity across the Council.

#### **Budget Proposals for Office of the Chief Executive**

A summary of the budget proposals is shown in Table 1 below. Further details on each individual element are presented in the subsequent paragraphs. The annexes also contain other potential growth and savings items which at this stage are not being recommended to Members.

**Table 1 - Summary of Budget Proposals** 

	Para. Ref	£'000
Base Budget 2010/11	19	3,413
Allocation for increments	20	36
Service Pressure proposals (Annex 2)	21	600
Savings proposals (Annex 3)	23-27	-650
Proposed Budget 2011/12		3,399

#### Base Budget (£3,413k)

This represents the latest budget for 2010/11, updated for the full year effect of decisions taken during 2010/11, e.g. supplementary estimates awarded.

#### Increments (£36k)

The job evaluation exercise resulted in a twelve grade structure with four levels within each band. 2011/12 is the final year that will include incremental payments for staff appointed at the bottom of the grade as part of that.

#### Service Pressures (£600k)

A range of options for service pressure proposals has been considered and in view of the overall available resources it is proposed that only those proposals shown in Annex 2 are included as the preferred options for Office of the Chief Executive. The proposals put forward are the result of a rigorous assessment process, which included looking at the risk to customers and staff, equalities impacts, legislative requirement, proven customer demand and the Council's corporate objectives. There is a general price freeze on most budgets. The amount allowed within service pressures for price inflation is to fund known price increases, e.g. contract payments.

#### **Contingency Items**

The Executive Leader should note that there are potential expenditure pressures that may materialise in 2011/12 but which are not yet certain or not quantifiable at this stage. The Executive will decide on 15 February 2011 whether or not to set a general contingency to provide possible funding for such items for 2011/12.

#### Savings Proposals (£-650k OCE, £-50k Strategic Housing)

- The Executive Leader will be aware that the 2010/11 budget savings were significant and that all Directorates are operating within a tight financial environment. In addition the Council has accelerated its' efficiency programme, More For York, which had an initial target of generating £15m of budget savings over three years, to meet the financial constraints of the governments' spending Review and the provisional finance settlement.
- In seeking to achieve savings for the 2011/12 budget Directorates have examined budgets with a view to identifying savings that have a minimum impact on the services provided to the public, customers and the wider Council and are not already included in existing blueprints for More For York. They have concentrated on initiatives that:
  - improve quality and efficiency
  - Reduce Management and administrative costs
  - Protect frontline services especially services for the most vulnerable members of our community
  - Result from ongoing service reviews
  - generate income
  - address budgetary underspends
  - improve cash flow and interest earnings.
- In addition to the initiatives listed above the price increases and list of savings also include proposals to increase fees and charges (see also section below). Generally these are in line with inflation, but this is varied by directorates as they are affected by national constraints/requirements.
- Annex 3a shows the full list of savings proposals for the Office of the Chief Executive portfolio.
- Annex 3b shows the full list of savings proposals for the Strategic Housing service within the Communities & Neighbourhoods Directorate.

#### **Fees and Charges**

There are no external fees and charges levied by the Office of the Chief Executive.

#### Consultation

This paper forms part of the Council's budget consultation. The results of consultation to date are included in the report. These include a Your City Questionnaire, YouChoose, an online questionnaire, a public meeting led by the Leader of the Council and Director of Customer and Business Support Services where participants were presented with information on pressures facing each directorate, and a further session with the business communities of the city.

#### **Options**

As part of the consultation process the Executive Leader is asked to provide comments or alternative suggestions on the proposals shown in Annexes 2 and 3.

#### **Analysis**

31 All the analysis is provided in the body of the report and the annexes.

## **Corporate Priorities**

The budget represents the opportunity to prioritise resources towards corporate priority areas. The principles set out in this report which have driven the development of savings and growth proposals are derived from the Councils corporate priorities.

#### **Implications**

- 33 The implications are:
  - Financial the financial implications are dealt with in the body of the report.
  - Human Resources The original OCE restructure removed 13.1FTEs from the structure, which was agreed by the Executive on 2<sup>nd</sup> November 2011 (ref. CORS01e, Annex 3). The restructure and all necessary consultations with the unions are currently underway. The savings proposed in this report result in a reduction of a further 2 posts (ref. OCES01) which are subject to the Council's Supporting Transformation (Management of Change) process.
  - Equalities –The consideration of the impact of these proposals on each equalities strand has been carefully considered by officers as part of the budget preparation process. Consultation has also taken place with representatives of groups in York and feedback has been incorporated. Individual Equalities Impact Assessments (EIA) have been undertaken where appropriate and the impacts of each proposal are set out in Annex 3. An Overall EIA of the budget has been undertaken and will be a background paper to the Executive report.
  - Legal there are no legal implications to this report.
  - Crime and Disorder there are no specific crime and disorder implications to this report.
  - Information Technology there are no information technology implications to this report.
  - Property there are no property implications to this report
  - Other there are no other implications to this report.

#### **Risk Management**

34 Key reporting mechanisms to Members on budget matters will continue to be through mid-year monitoring reports and the final Revenue Outturn report for the year. The format/timing of these reports has recently been considered by the Council's Management Team but as a minimum they will report on

- forecast out-turn compared to budgets and will also address the progress made on investments and savings included within the budgets.
- The budget setting process always entails a degree of risk as managers attempt to assess known and uncertain future events. As with any budget the key to mitigating risk is prompt monitoring and appropriate management control. As such updated figures and revised corrective actions will be monitored via Directorate Management Teams, Corporate Management Team and the monitor reports during the year.

#### Recommendations

- The Executive Leader is invited to consider whether the budget proposals are in line with the Council's priorities.
- The Executive Leader is invited to provide comments on the budget proposals for savings and growth which have been prepared by Officers and contained in this report, which are intended to from part of the Council's budget to be considered by the Budget Executive on 15 February 2011.
- The Executive Leader is invited to provide comments on the areas for consultation for the revenue budget contained in this report, which may form part of the Council's budget to be considered by the Budget Executive on 15 February 2011.
- The Executive Leader is asked to consider the budget proposals for consultation for Office of the Chief Executive for 2011/12 contained in this report and listed below and provide comments to be submitted to the Budget Executive on 15 February 2011.
  - 2011/12 Base budget as set out in paragraph 19;
  - Service Pressure proposals as set out in Annex 2;
  - Savings proposals as set out in Annex 3a and 3b.

#### Reason

As part of the 2011-12 budget consultation.

## Page 17

#### **Contact Details**

#### **Authors:**

Patrick Looker Finance Manager Customer and Business Support Services Tel 551633

#### **Chief Officers responsible for the report:**

Kersten England Chief executive Tel: 551000 Ian Floyd

Director of Customer and Business Support Services

Tel: 551100

### Specialist Implications Officer(s) None

**Wards Affected:** List wards or tick box to indicate all  $\sqrt{}$ 

#### **Background Working Papers**

#### **Annexes**

Annex 1 - 2010/11 Budget

Annex 2 - Service Pressure Proposals

Annex 3a - Savings Proposals OCE

Annex 3b - Savings Proposals - Strategic Housing - Communities and

Neighbourhoods

This page is intentionally left blank

## **SERVICE PLAN**

## **OFFICE OF THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE SUMMARY (BASE BUDGET)**

	ORIGINA ESTIMATE 2010/11 £'000
Employees	2,830
Premises	1
Transport	7
Supplies & Services	874
Miscellaneous	2,606
Capital Financing	-
Gross Expenditure	6,318
Income	(2,905
Net Expenditure	3,413

COST CENTRE EXPENDITU	J <u>RE</u> ORIGINAL ESTIMATE 2010/11
	£'000
AD Policy, Performance & Partnerships	74
Chief Executive	409
Corporate and Democratic Core	1,613
Commercial Hub	(73)
Business Change & Performance	1,123
Strategy, Policy & Partnerships	267
Net Expenditure	3,413

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref	Brief Description	Net Cost 2011/12 £(000)	Full Year 2012/13 £(000)	Full Year 2013/14 £(000)	Staffing Impact	Customer Impact	Equalities Impact
	FYE M4Y 2010/11 - Corporate This is the ongoing use of £600k savings generated from More for York in 2011/12 to fund the More for York programme team within OCE; as agreed by the Executive on 2nd November 2010.		600	600			

Total Growth 600 600 600

This page is intentionally left blank

## Office of the Chief Executive Savings Proposals 2011/12

		Net saving		Full Year	Staffing	Customer	Equalities
	-14-	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	Impact	Impact	Impact
005004	Brief Description	£(000) -58	£(000)	£(000) -58			
OCES01	Additional savings from restructure of OCE A reduction in the number of posts in the Strategy, Partnerships and Grants team by 2 FTEs.	-58	-58	-58	This saving results in the reduction of 2 FTEs.	reviewed as part of a review of	activity will ensure that the work of this team contributes to
OCES02/ OCES03	Your City Customer publication  Make a 45% reduction in the cost of the Council newspaper through reducing editions from 6 to 4 and using a more efficient distribution method.	-31	-31	-31		Although there will be a reduced frequency of communication to residents and other stakeholders, this will not have an impact as quality improvements will be made and ward communications will continue.	Decreased frequency of the Council newspaper is not expected to have any equalities impact.
OCES04	Reduce budget for Holocaust Memorial Day from £5k The Council will continue to support this event in the Communities and Neighbourhoods Directorate and will find alternative means and source alternative funding to ensure its continuing success.	-4	-4	-4		The Council will continue to support this event and will review how it is delivered and funded to ensure that it remains successful.	No Impact
OCES05	Reduce support budgets The restructure of the Directorate has consolidated teams within the directorate and general support budgets will be trimmed to reflect this.	-5	-	-5		No impact	No impact
OCES06	Cease Place Survey In August 2010, the statutory requirement to undertake the Place Survey was abolished by the new Government. This will reduce costs by £8k.	-8	-8	-8		No impact since the survey is no longer a statutory requirement.	No impact

## Office of the Chief Executive Savings Proposals 2011/12 Annex 3a

		Net saving		Full Year	Staffing	Customer	Equalities
		2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	Impact	Impact	Impact
	Brief Description	£(000)	£(000)	£(000)			
OCES07	Reduce number of Talkabout Panels The number of citizens consultation panels would be reduced from 3 to 2 each year. Currently there is a budget of £11k to run the panels.	-3	-3	-3			No impact as the panels are balanced to give representation to equalities strands.
OCES08	Cease production of News in Depth As a result if the introduction of a new intranet there is no need for a quarterly staff communication and this will no longer be published. More regular fortnightly newsletters will still be published using electronic means wherever possible, to reduce cost.	-6	-6	-6		No impact. Alternative methods of communication with staff will be used.	No impact - regular written, electronic and verbal updates will still be given to staff.
CORS01e	Full year effect of 2010/11 More for York Savings This is the full year effect of the Directorate savings for the More for York programme. These were agreed as part of the 2010/11 budget process.	-535	-535	-535		No external customer impact	Impact of post reductions covered by overall Budget Equalities Impact assessment

Total Savings <u>-650 -650 -650</u>

Brief Description	Net saving 2011/12 £(000)	Full Year 2012/13 £(000)	Full Year 2013/14 £(000)	Staffing Impact	Customer Impact	Equalities Impact
Affordable Housing Policy Consider the potential to develop a policy to increase income associated with the development of new affordable housing, bought by Registered Social Landlords on S106 sites.	0	-50	-50		No impact	No impact expected
Social New Homes Bonus Additional income, subject to confirmation of the New Homes Bonus Scheme. The saving is recurring for 5 years but not recurring beyond that time.	-50	-65			No impact	No impact expected

Total Savings -50 -115 -115

This page is intentionally left blank



#### **Decision Session of the Executive Leader**

1 February 2011

Joint Report of the Director of City Strategy and the Director of Customer and Business Support Services

# Revenue Budget Estimates 2011/12 – Economy & Asset Management

### **Purpose of Report**

- 1 This report presents the 2011/12 budget proposals for Economy and Asset Management. It includes:
  - The national context regarding local government funding and the implications for City of York Council
  - The approach that has been adopted to develop budget proposals
  - The outcomes of the customer budget consultation
  - the revenue budget for 2010/11 (Annex 1) to show the existing budgets
  - the budget adjusted and rolled forward from 2010/11 into 2011/12
  - the cost of pay and price increases and increments for the portfolio
  - proposals for service pressure costs and savings options for the portfolio area (Annexes 2 and 3)
  - proposals for fees and charges (annex 4)
- Budget Council will be held on 24 February 2011 and will make decisions on the overall budget for the Council. In order to facilitate the decision making process the Executive are meeting on 15 February 2011 to consider the recommendations identified by the individual portfolio Executive Members and the results of the consultation exercise.
- The Executive Leader is therefore asked to consider the budget proposals included in this report and identify their recommendations(after considering the proposals in annexes 2 and 3) which will be considered by the Executive as part of the consultation exercise. The Executive Leader is invited to provide comments on the budget proposals in this report.

### **Background**

- The financial context for the 2011/12 budget has been significantly impacted by :-
  - Worldwide recession leading to Central Government deficit reduction plan
  - Unprecedented reductions in Public Sector spending
  - At the same time we have unavoidable ongoing financial pressures arising from

## Page 28

- Increasing number of older people, living longer and requiring care and support services for longer
- An increase in the number of severely disabled children who require intensive support into and throughout adulthood
- Reductions in income from Council services as people have less money to spend
- Reduction in funding of subsidised bus travel for older people
- Increased cost of waste disposal
- o Impact of changes to Pensions and NI legislation
- The Council's 2011/12 budget is being developed within the constraints of the extremely challenging financial climate, set out in the government's Spending Review and provisional finance settlement information. In particular:
  - a Total reductions in Government funding of 28% over the next 4 years, heavily frontloaded with CYC's grant being cut by 13.3% in 2011/12
  - b 22 grants, worth £14,403k in 2010/11 and with an indicative value of £11,478k in 2011/12, have been rolled into the formula grant.
  - c The increase in formula grant in the provisional settlement, including the grants transferred in, is only £5,183k, leaving a shortfall in funding of £9,221k between the two years.
  - d 23 grants, worth £8,200k in 2010/11, have been transferred to the new Early Intervention Grant, for which the council will receive £6,350k in 2011/12 a further shortfall of £1,850k.
  - e 21 grants, worth £13,685k in 2010/11, have been incorporated within the Dedicated Schools Grant (DSG). The provisional DSG for 2011/12 is £106,564k, an increase of £13,659k from the 2010/11 level (subject to pupil number adjustments).
  - f There are a further five grants (worth £759k in 2010/11) as yet still under review.
  - g Against these pressures Executive were advised in December that directorates would need to find savings of £15m to be able to set a balance budget for 2011/12.
  - h In addition, other grants (worth £5,554k in 2010/11) which formerly were direct grants to service areas have been cancelled, creating additional financial pressures in directorates.
  - i While the Council has been penalised over the past few years by the workings of the floors and ceilings within the formula grant mechanism, for 2011/12 this same process will offer the protection of a damping gain of £2,541k.
  - j The Council will receive a further reduction in formula grant of £4,639k in 2012/13.

- Against these funding reductions the Council has been offered a sum of £1,828k per annum for each year of the Spending Review period if the council tax level in the area is frozen at the 2010/11 level. At the same time the threat of 'capping' local authorities who decide to raise council tax levels or net expenditure above a level yet to be determined by the government has not been removed. York currently has the second lowest Council Tax of all Unitary authorities.
- The 2010/11 revenue budget monitoring process has identified areas of activity that currently have insufficient capacity to deal with the increased demands on those services. In addition consideration has been given to the Councils top priorities, and the need to ensure that key front line areas of activity, particularly those in respect of adults and children, can continue to be provided. From this analysis, specific areas of investment will be proposed within the Councils 2011/12 budget, in particular within the following areas:
  - Increasing demand on adult social care services
  - Impact of economic downturn on the Council's income generating services
- The proposed budget for 2011/12 reflects the need to direct investment into these areas in order that planning and monitoring of service delivery and improvement can take place against an adequate resourcing platform.
- In addition, the Council recognises that adequate provision needs to be created within the budget to ensure that the continuing financial impact of the economic downturn can be contained effectively. Following detailed review of economic pressures both on front line services and the Council's Treasury Management function, it is proposed that money will be set aside within the budget to contain the impact of these pressures.
- In order to create the financial capacity to enable adequate investment in these priority areas the budget strategy has been based around certain key financial management principles. A fundamental maxim of the strategy is that Directorates have been made clearly responsible for the robust and effective self-management of their existing financial resources and that restraint has been expected in putting forward for additional growth in budget to be funded corporately.
- Directorates have been expected to contain their net expenditure within clearly defined and strictly enforced cash limits with a clear expectation that Directorates self manage all non-exceptional budget pressures within this cash limit. These pressures include the anticipated cost of the pay award and any incremental increases due in year. Explicitly linked to self-management within defined cash limits has been the requirement for directorates to demonstrate the re-allocation of budgets in order to contain internal financial pressures.
- 12 CYC has a strong track record of delivering Value for Money and initiated an innovative efficiency programme, More for York which is on track to deliver £9m savings from the work undertaken in the current year so it is well placed to meet the financial challenges set out above.

#### **Budget Consultation**

As with previous years we have asked residents what services they value and where they would wish CYC to continue providing the levels of service they receive now and where they think we should reduce spending. This year steps were taken to reduce the cost of the Budget Consultation, due to the very nature of the consultation. Budget questions were included in Your City and available online. Residents were also able to give their views through a separate online budgeting tool - YouChoose. The consultation generated a statistically reliable response of 738 for Your City and 465 for YouChoose. Whilst the level of response is lower than last year the results remain statistically reliable, and furthermore overall spend was less than £1,000

#### Your City Questions - This was based upon 3 questions

- 60% of residents would choose to meet the budget challenge through higher fees and charges, 44% through reductions in service and only 30% of residents through increased Council Tax.
- People are more willing to pay increased charges for Planning, Parking and Leisure facilities than they are for Homecare services.
- In deciding whether budgets for different services should stay the same or be reduced, residents were more likely to say that funding for social care services, community safety and street based services should remain the same 85% Children's social care, 75% crime prevention and community safety, 76% Adult social care, 76% waste and recycling, 74% road and footpath maintenance and 70% street cleaning.
- Residents were more willing to reduce spending on a broad range of leisure and culture services and on young peoples services and transport with 64% reducing sport and leisure facilities (including events and activities), 63% reducing theatres and museums, 47% reducing parks and open spaces, 45% reducing libraries, 42% reducing young peoples services and 41% reducing transport services.

You Choose Questionnaire - This was an interactive online tool that asked residents to identify how to make £15m savings by either increasing/decreasing Council Tax, spend or fees and charges on a range of services.

- Perhaps because residents were asked to identify total savings they were generally much more likely to reduce expenditure in all areas. However the same pattern of preference as in Your City was repeated with 98% of residents reducing the budget for Council support and public engagement, 92% reduced leisure and culture budgets, 89% reduced Adult Social Care budgets, 81% reduced Children's Social Care budgets whilst community safety was reduced by 74% of residents.
- In terms of service efficiencies and saving money, respondents were very supportive of all the options. A review of the authority's fleet vehicles was supported by 82% of respondents, sharing services with partners by 78% and outsourcing services to external suppliers by 57%.

#### **Principles**

14 Directorates have identified options for savings for consideration by the

Executive portfolio holder based on 4 key principles. Each of these principles will bring benefits for the citizens of York, and each will be guide us as we tackle the realities of significant budgetary changes in the months and years to come

• **Create-** opportunities for our citizens and communities, our businesses and educational establishments to prosper and thrive.

#### Protect

- The most vulnerable members of our community older people, people with disabilities and, children– by ensuring that the services with which we provide them are the very best possible
- All citizens by ensuring that vital Council services that secure their well-being continue to be delivered and that all customer groups receive equal outcomes
- The financial interests of our residents by not raising the amount of Council Tax they pay in 2011/12
- Staff by ensuring wherever possible that we provide security of employment.

#### Partner

- Increase public participation in decision-making and service delivery
- Bring together service provision from a range of agencies at a local level so that individuals, community groups and voluntary bodies can shape and prioritise and even take control of delivering services that are needed at a local level.
- With the voluntary and community sector; health services, and city partners in the police, fire service, education and business to join up services and make the most of all the resources within the city
- Cost and Quality of services are important to CYC where we cannot match both the cost and quality of service offered by other providers we will consider using the Community and Voluntary sector, staff cooperatives or the Private sector to deliver services.

#### Efficiency

- We will continue to monitor spend and drive costs down
- We will rationalise and reshape services to make them as efficient as possible
- Get better value from our non salary spend through effective procurement.

#### **Delivering the Savings**

Once again the More for York programme will be used to support the delivery of the savings. The programme will now be on a much larger scale and Directorate Management Teams will be central to delivery and managing the changes. It must be stressed that achievement of these efficiencies will not be easy to deliver but they are essential in order to deliver investment into priority areas. The scale and pace of the transformation process in coming years will be critical to the Council maintaining financial stability. In addition,

clearly with the future pressures on public spending, combined with known forecast increased pressures in children's care, adult care, and waste management, the Council will face the need to both achieve significant transformational change, and review the overall type and level of service provision in coming years.

#### **Directorate Overview**

- 16 Following the budget review the City Strategy directorate will continue to:
  - Spend over £8m revenue and £2m capital on Local Transport initiatives including Concessionary Fares, Subsidised Bus Services and improving Local Highway, Cycling and Pedestrian facilities
  - Provide a high quality planning service including a refreshed Development Management Service, Building Control and Land Charges Service
  - Seek to reduce the carbon footprint of the council and wider city.
  - Invest c£2m in Economic Development Initiatives including maintaining the city centre as a key economic driver as well as supporting employers and small business across the city.
  - Produce and maintain Strategic Plans for the City on Economic Development, Spatial Planning and Transport.
  - · Manage Council's Property Asset base.

The proposals within the budget aim to:

#### Create

- We recognise the investment and jobs that Developers bring to our city.
  We will continue to support them by making improvements to the way in
  which our planning services work. A new chargeable pre-application
  service will be introduced to advise on how national, regional and local
  planning processes could apply to any proposal. In addition the Council
  will provide a point of contact to support an application through all its
  stages.
- We will continue to find ways to support the promotion of the city as a tourist attraction and will increase the number of markets and events held in 2011.

#### Protect

- We will continue to drive down carbon emissions and support sustainability in the city by improving energy management across the council's buildings and facilities.
- The Park & Ride service has been key in reducing congestion and in safely transporting residents and visitors to the City Centre. A 50p charge for Concessionary Pass holders will be introduced to reduce the burden on lost Concessionary Fare funding. The council will continue to provide significant out of town free parking and to safely transport approximately 1.5 million people into the city centre and back.

#### **Partnering**

- We will continue to provide grants to organisations who work with us to support economic development and tourism in the city. Given the reduction in the Council's funding from Government, there will be proportionate reductions in the level of grants provided to others.
- We will work with other Councils to find ways of delivering services jointly to reduce cost and maintain quality services to residents. In particular we plan to work with neighbouring Council's to exploit York's traffic management expertise.
- We will work with schools and parents to ensure the ongoing provision of cycle training for children and young people as part of our commitment to healthy lifestyles and sustainability.

#### Efficiency

- We will continue to remove duplication and inefficiency in our services
- Reduce costs through improved procurement of services.
- Reduce management posts and other posts following a review of all services.
- Where the Council is using its own vehicles to transport residents across the city, we will consider how spare seats could be offered to Dial & Ride customers.
- We will renegotiate the cost of concessionary bus services and subsidised bus services.

#### **Budget Proposals for Economy & Asset Management**

A summary of the budget proposals is shown in Table 1 below. Further details on each individual element are presented in the subsequent paragraphs. The annexes also contain other potential growth and savings items which at this stage are not being recommended to Members.

**Table 1 - Summary of Budget Proposals** 

	Para. Ref	£'000
Base Budget 2010/11 (Annex 1)	18	2,740
Adjustment for former service grants transferring into the general formula grant (RSG)	19	65
Allocation for increments	21	32
Service Pressure proposals (Annex 2)	22	255
Savings proposals (Annex 3)	24-27	-629
Proposed Budget 2011/12		2,463

#### Base Budget (£2,740k)

This represents the latest budget for 2010/11, updated for the full year effect of decisions taken during 2010/11, e.g. supplementary estimates awarded.

#### Adjustment for Former Service Grants (£65k)

- This adjustment is the budgetary effect of former direct service grants being transferred to general grants. The review of the service provision identified in paragraph 20 includes areas that are no longer funded by direct grants.
- The Economic Assessment Duty grant which previously was included within the Area Base Grant totalling £65k has been incorporated into Revenue Support Grant.

#### Increments (£32k)

The job evaluation exercise resulted in a twelve grade structure with four levels within each band. 2011/12 is the final year that will include incremental payments for staff appointed at the bottom of the grade as part of that process.

#### Service Pressures (£255k)

A range of options for service pressure proposals have been considered and in view of the overall available resources it is proposed that only those proposals shown in Annex 2 are included as the preferred options for Economy & Asset Management. The proposals put forward are the result of a rigorous assessment process, which included looking at the risk to customers and staff, legislative requirement, proven customer demand and the Council's corporate objectives. There is a general price freeze on most budgets. The amount allowed within service pressures for price inflation is to fund known price increases, e.g. contract payments.

#### **Contingency Items**

The Executive Leader should note that there are potential expenditure pressures that may materialise in 2011/12 but which are not yet certain or not quantifiable at this stage. The Executive will decide on 15 February 2011 whether or not to set a general contingency to provide possible funding for such items for 2011/12.

#### Savings Proposals (£-629k)

- The Executive Leader will be aware that the 2010/11 budget savings were significant and that all Directorates are operating within a tight financial environment. In addition the Council has accelerated its' efficiency programme, More For York, which had an initial target of generating £15m of budget savings over three years, to meet the financial constraints of the governments' spending Review and the provisional finance settlement. In addition to those savings included in the efficiency programme Directorates have looked at other areas within their control.
- In seeking to achieve savings for the 2011/12 budget Directorates have

examined budgets with a view to identifying savings that have a minimum impact on the services provided to the public, customers and the wider Council and are not already included in the blueprints for More For York. Instead they have concentrated on initiatives that:

- improve quality and efficiency
- take advantage of ongoing service and/or Best Value reviews
- generate income
- address budgetary underspends
- improve cash flow and interest earnings
- generate savings from the technical and financial administration functions of the Council
- In addition to the initiatives listed above the price increases and list of savings also include proposals to increase fees and charges (see also section below). Generally these are in line with inflation, but this is varied by directorates as they are affected by national constraints/requirements.
- Annex 3 shows the full list of savings proposals for the Economy & Asset Management service.

#### **Fees and Charges**

The details of the proposed fees and charges for the services provided by this portfolio are set out in Annex 4. Where fees and charges increases are being set above the inflation requirement they have been included in Annex 3.

#### Consultation

This paper forms part of the Council's budget consultation. The results of consultation to date are included in the report. These include a Your City Questionnaire, YouChoose, an online questionnaire, a public meeting led by the Leader of the Council and Director of Customer and Business Support Services where participants were presented with information on pressures facing each directorate, and a further session with the business communities of the city.

#### **Options**

As part of the consultation process the Executive Leader is asked to provide comments or alternative suggestions on the proposals shown in Annexes 2, 3 and 4.

#### **Analysis**

31 All the analysis is provided in the body of the report and the annexes.

#### **Corporate Priorities**

32 The budget represents the opportunity to prioritise resources towards

corporate priority areas. The principles set out in this report which have driven the development of savings and growth proposals are derived from the Councils corporate priorities.

#### **Implications**

#### 33 The implications are:

- Financial the financial implications are dealt with in the body of the report.
- Human Resources There are no direct staff reductions in relation to the savings proposals identified in Annex 2. However as a result of the service review across the City Strategy Directorate it is anticipated that a net total of between 25 and 28 posts will be deleted. It is possible that some of these posts will work within Economy & Asset Management. The Directorate Management Team are undertaking required consultation with unions and a report detailing the implications is scheduled to go to the Executive in February. As a result of declining workload within Property Services a total of eight posts have been identified as no longer affordable with reduced income. This proposed new structure has been shared with the Unions and the Change Management process is being followed.
- Equalities -The consideration of the impact of these proposals on each equalities strand has been carefully considered by officers as part of the budget preparation process. Consultation has also taken place with representatives of groups in York and feedback has been incorporated. Individual Equalities Impact Assessments (EIA) have been undertaken where appropriate and the impacts of each proposal are set out in Annex 3. An Overall EIA of the budget has been undertaken and will be a background paper to the Executive report..
- Legal There are no legal implications to the report
- Crime and Disorder there are no specific crime and disorder implications to this report.
- Information Technology there are no information technology implications to this report
- Property there are no property implications to this report
- Other there are no other implications to this report

#### **Risk Management**

- 34 Key reporting mechanisms to Members on budget matters will continue to be through mid-year monitoring reports and the final Revenue Outturn report for the year. The format/timing of these reports has recently been considered by the Council's Management Team but as a minimum they will report on forecast out-turn compared to budgets and will also address the progress made on investments and savings included within the budgets.
- The budget setting process always entails a degree of risk as managers attempt to assess known and uncertain future events. This year has demonstrated the difficulty of achieving this. As with any budget the key to mitigating risk is prompt monitoring and appropriate management control. As such updated figures and revised corrective actions will be monitored via Directorate Management Teams, Corporate Management Team and the monitor reports during the year.

#### Recommendations

- The Executive Leader is invited to consider whether the budget proposals are in line with the Council's priorities.
- The Executive Leader is invited to provide comments on the budget proposals for savings and growth which have been prepared by Officers and contained in this report, which are intended to from part of the Council's budget to be considered by the Budget Executive on 15 February 2011.
- The Executive Leader is asked to consider the budget proposals for consultation for Economy & Asset Management for 2011/12 contained in this report and listed below and provide comments to be submitted to the Budget Executive on 15 February 2011.
  - 2011/12 Base budget as set out in paragraph 18;
  - Service Pressure proposals as set out in Annex 2;
  - Savings proposals as set out in Annex 3;
  - Fees and charges as set out in Annex 4.

#### Reason

As part of the 2011-12 budget consultation

#### **Contact Details**

**Authors:** 

Patrick Looker
Finance Manager
Customer & Business Support Services
Tel 551633

**Chief Officers responsible for the report:** 

Bill Woolley

Director of City Strategy

Tel: 551330 lan Floyd

Director of Customer and Business Support

Services Tel: 551100

#### Specialist Implications Officer(s) None

**Wards Affected:** List wards or tick box to indicate all  $\sqrt{}$ 

#### **Background Working Papers**

Working Papers held in Customer and Business Support Services

#### Annexes

Annex 1 - 2010/11 Budget

Annex 2 - Service Pressure Proposals

Annex 3 - Savings Proposals

Annex 4 - Fees and Charges

# **ECONOMY & ASSET MANAGEMENT**

# **SERVICE PLAN**

# **SUMMARY**

<u>Detailed Expe</u>	nditur <u>e</u>	Cost Centre E
	2010/11	
	Base	
DETAIL	Budget	COST CENTRE
	£'000	
Employees	3,877	Economy & Asset Manager
Assets & Premises	3,873	
Transport	36	
Supplies And Services	1,748	
Miscellaneous	-	
Recharges	2,238	
Capital Financing	2,362	
Gross Expenditure	14,134	
Income	(11,394)	
Net Expenditure	2,740	Net Expenditure

Cost Centre Expenditure				
COST CENTRE	2010/11 Base Budget £'000			
Economy & Asset Management	2,740			
Net Expenditure	2,740			

#### ECONOMY AND ASSET MANAGEMENT SERVICE PRESSURES

Ref	Brief Description	Net Cost 2011/12 £(000)	Full Year 2012/13 £(000)	Full Year 2013/14 £(000)	Staffing Impact	Customer Impact	Equalities Impact
CSTG03	Income Pressure - Commercial Portfolio The income budget for the Councils Commercial portfolio is currently significantly higher than actual income primarily due to an unachievable saving proposed in 2009/10 budget in relation to an estimated wayleave at Harewood Whin that did not progress.	170	170	170	None	None	None
CSTG11	Key Account Management The council agreed to bring Key Account Management in house following the withdrawal of Yorkshire Forward support to York-england.com. This growth represents the full year impact of undertaking the current level of support	35	35		The growth supports the	Opportunity for businesses to come to one point of contact re dealing with the council.	None
CSTG12	Future Prospects The downturn in external funding within Future Prospects means that it is necessary to increase council contribution in order to maintain current level of services. Without additional investment the service would need to reduce significantly its core activities.	50	50		Will maintain staffing levels as external income reduces.	Will maintain front line services with customer.	Future Prospects offers a free of charge service to all but often deals with vulnerable citizens, (eg unemployed, benefits, looking for careers advice etc)

**Service Pressures Total** 

255	255	255

# ECONOMY AND ASSET MANAGEMENT SAVINGS PROPOSALS

Economy &	Asset Management	Net Cost	Full Year	Full Year	Staffing	Customer	Equalities
		2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	Impact	Impact	Impact
		£(000)	£(000)	£(000)	·	·	·
Ref	Brief Description						
CSTED01	North Yorkshire Partnership Unit Withdraw commitment to Partnership Unit which from 1st April 2011 becomes incorporated into North Yorkshire County Council	-20	-20	-20	None	None	None
CSTED02	Contribution to Visit York  15% (£60k) reduction in cash contribution to Visit York reducing contribution from £400k to £340k. Reduction will impact on a range of tourism activities, particularly marketing spend for tourism within the city.	-60	-60	-60	May be staff reductions within Visit York.	Reductions in events and product development	None
CSTED03	Contribution to Science City York Reduction in contribution from £180k to £100k. This will bring the councils contribution in line with other supporting organisations, although will still leave a significant gap in the current level of funding due to the loss of Yorkshire Forward monies.	-80	-80	-80		Will impact businesses supported by Science City. Reductions in events activities and marketing.	None
CSTED04	Welcome to Yorkshire Cease council contribution to Welcome to Yorkshire (regional tourist agency).	-34	-34	-34		May result in reduced marketing promoting York and Yorkshire as a brand. May result in fewer visitors.	None
CSTED05	City Centre Events Target for additional income for specialist markets / city centre events	-20	-20	-20	None	None	None
CSTED06	City Centre Partnership Reduce expenditure on partnership activity. Reduction will be a combination of reducing activity as well as looking at undertaking current activity in a more cost effective way.	-10	-10	-10	None	None	None
CSTED07	Key Cities Withdraw funding contribution to Key Cities initiative.	-10	-10	-10	None	None	None
CSTED08	Eco-Business Support  Due to higher than forecast occupancy at the centre the budgeted subsidy for the centre is substantially no longer required.	-10		-10	None	None	None
CSTED09	Business Support / Trends Review of activity with a target reduction of £15k in this area (20%).	-15		-15	None	None	None
CORS01d	Full Year Effect - 2010/11 More For York Savings Full year savings from the organisation review and review of Facilities Management across the council.	-370	-370	-370	the portfolio area. Also eight staff	The impact of the reduction in posts will be the Directorate being unable to provide the same level of service however, the redcutions are not directly in public facing services.	It is not anticipated that the job losses will have any direct equality implications.

Total Savings -629 -629 -629

# Page 45

## ECONC

# PROPOSALS 2011/12

**EMENT** 

#### **NEWGATE MARKET TOLLS**

DAY	ZONE	AVERAGE	Current Fee	Proposed Fee	Increase over	DAY	ZONE	AVERAGE	Current Fee	Proposed Fee	Increase over
DA.	20112	OCCUPANCY	1 00	100	2010/11	DAI.	20.112	OCCUPANCY	1 00	100	2010/11
			2010/11	2011/12	(+ or -)				2010/11	2011/12	(+ or -)
MONDAY	Α	95.0%	17.00	17.50	2.9%	FRIDAY	Α	95.0%	25.00	26.00	4.0%
	В	95.0%	15.00	15.25	1.7%		В	95.0%	24.00	25.00	4.2%
	С	78.0%	10.00	10.00	Nil		С	75.0%	22.00	22.00	Nil
	D	25.0%	6.00	6.00	Nil		D	50.0%	13.00	13.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	18.00	18.00	Nil		E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	42.00	5.0%		F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	43.00	7.5%
		T									
TUESDAY	Α	95.0%	21.00	21.50	2.4%	SATURDAY	Α	100.0%	33.00	34.00	3.0%
	В	95.0%	19.50	20.00	2.6%		В	100.0%	30.00	31.00	3.3%
	С	70.0%	17.00	17.00	Nil		С	78.0%	24.50	24.50	Nil
	D	30.0%	12.00	12.00	Nil		D	50.0%	21.00	21.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil		E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	42.00	5.0%		F - o/s	100.0%	45.00	48.00	6.7%
WEDNESDAY	Α	95.0%	20.00	20.50	2.5%	SUNDAY	Α	100.0%	23.00	23.50	2.2%
	В	95.0%	18.00	18.50	2.8%		В	100.0%	22.00	22.50	2.3%
	С	70.0%	16.00	16.00	Nil		С	78.0%	19.00	19.00	Nil
	D	30.0%	11.00	11.00	Nil		D	30.0%	7.00	7.00	Nil
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil		E - o/s	75.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	42.00	5.0%		F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	42.00	5.0%
	_					i i		1			
THURSDAY	A	100.0%	22.00	22.50	2.3%		Α	Jubbergate			
	В	95.0%	21.50	22.00	2.3%	KEY :-	В	Prime Stalls			
	C	75.0%	19.00	19.00	Nil		С	Standard Stalls	S		
	D	50.0%	11.00	11.00	Nil		D	Rear Stalls			
	E - o/s	78.0%	20.00	20.00	Nil		E - o/s	Open spaces p			
	F - o/s	100.0%	40.00	42.00	5.0%		F - o/s	Brunch Wagor	1		

Event Markets	Current Fee 2009/10	Proposed Fee	over 2009/10 (+ or -)	Effect on total Income
	£	£	£	£
Easter Fayre Market	100	105	5	
St Nicholas Fayre - Parliament Street	150	160	10	
St Nicholas Fayre - Kings Square/Coppergate	100	105	5	12,000
St Nicholas Fayre - Guildhall	30	32	2	
Misc. Events (Farmers, York's Day, Cont., Christmas markets etc)	various	various		

TOTAL ADDITIONAL INCOME (EVENT MARKETS)				12,000
CASUAL MARKET TRADERS - levy	2.00	2.00	0.00	
Parking Waivers (applicable during footstreet hours)	20.00	25.00	5	



#### **Decision Session – Executive Leader**

1 February 2011

Report of the Director of City Strategy

#### Update on green jobs

#### **Summary**

- 1. This report seeks to provide an update on actions taken following the report produced by the Green Jobs taskforce.
- 2. This report has a good strategic fit with the long term aspirations of the city in relation to all themes within the Sustainable Community Strategy, particularly those in relation to Thriving City and Sustainable City but also with respect to Inclusive City and Learning City.

#### **Background**

- 3. The recommendations of the Green Jobs Taskforce were reported to the Council's Executive in October 2009. These set out actions to be taken to stimulate the further development of a low carbon economy in the City, taking account of existing activity already underway. The Taskforce used the Local Government Association publication "Creating Green Jobs: developing low carbon economies" as a guide to shaping these recommendations.
- 4. Key to the recommendations was the Council working in partnership with a number of organisations to take forward actions. The attached report provides an update on progress made.

#### Consultation

5. A range of partners were involved in the Green Jobs taskforce. Subsequent to their recommendations being produced, further consultation has taken place through the Without Walls Local Strategic Partnership and constituent thematic partnerships, particularly the York Economic Partnership and the York Environment Partnership. A survey of local businesses has also been undertaken – the results from this are also appended to this report.

#### **Options**

6. The options are to note the progress being made with taking forward the recommendations from the Green Jobs taskforce, and to consider any additional actions to be undertaken.

#### **Corporate Priorities**

7. The actions in this report support the Inclusive City, Learning City, Sustainable and Thriving City elements of the Sustainable Community Strategy and the Council's Corporate Strategy.

#### **Implications**

#### Financial

8. There are no direct financial implications arising from the report. Any future initiatives to be undertaken by the Council, in addition to those actioned already, in response to the recommendations of the Task Force will be the subject of further reports, including consideration of the financial implications.

#### **Human Resources (HR)**

9. None directly from this report.

#### **Equalities**

10. None directly from this report.

#### Legal

11. None directly from this report

#### **Crime and Disorder**

12. None directly from this report.

#### Information Technology (IT)

13. None directly from this report.

#### **Property**

14. None directly from this report.

#### Risk management

15. Subsequent actions to be developed will be assessed in order to ascertain their effectiveness.

#### Recommendations

16. That the Executive Leader notes the progress made in taking action in line with the recommendations of the Green Jobs taskforce and considers any further action to be undertaken.

Reason: To support the strategic objectives of the Sustainable Community Strategy and Corporate Strategy.

#### **Contact Details**

Roger Ranson Assistant Director, Economic Development and Partnerships 01904 551614

### Chief Officer Responsible for the

report:

Bill Woolley Director of City Strategy

**Report Approved** 

For further information please contact the author of the report Wards affected – ALL

#### **Specialist implications officer**

Financial: Patrick Looker, Finance Manager, 551633

#### **Annexes**

Annexe A – Green Jobs Briefing Annexe B – York Green Jobs Survey – Quantitative Results



#### **GREEN JOBS BRIEFING**

There are a number of strands of work that are being carried out following the report to the Council's Executive:

- 1. Research into the scale and prospects for green jobs in York
- 1.1 Research has been undertaken to establish a methodology for counting green jobs in the City. This estimates the number of green jobs presently in York as approximately 7,000, with the potential for this to grow by 25% over the next 10 years. Key specific sectors are considered to be home energy/insulation, biomass, research and links to regional supply chains. Part of this research has involved consultation with the local business community (attached).
- 1.2 Yorkshire Cities have commissioned some research funded by RIEP to examine the current scale of green job opportunities in the urban authorities of Yorkshire and the Humber, an informed assessment of employment prospects to 2020 and clear policy recommendations on the ways in which the Yorkshire Cities can maximise opportunities. This work is now well underway and a final report is expected in February. Some details of this commission are available on their website www.yorkshirecities.org.uk.
- 1.3 Any further research to await outcomes from the above 2 pieces of work.

#### 2. Higher York

- 2.1 Higher York has engaged, through the Leader and officers of the Council, with the developer and main contractor of the new CYC HQ building. Two meetings have been held with Miller Construction and S Harrison Ltd to discuss local labour, training and learning opportunities using the model developed at Heslington East with Construction Skills. An event will be held on 14 February at York College for local companies who are interested in working at the West Offices site. Both companies have been very positive about working with local colleges, schools and universities to support skills development including in the 'green skills' area.
- 2.2 HY discussion held to look at skills development in relation to current and future "green" programmes/training, including construction, offered in the City. Awaiting outcome from above research together the renewable energy survey commissioned by the City of York Council. These two pieces of work, together with the LDF will support the direction of travel for future skills provision. This activity is likely to take place in the next months.



2.3 LDF with HY looking at planning policy to roll out the Construction Skills Academy - although not all about green jobs, it would in principle support those wishing to learn about green building techniques. There is also a possible link into Council procurement. This work is ongoing.

#### 3. Sustainability Team

#### 3.1 Promoting low carbon development and energy planning:

On going work to create a renewable energy viability study for the city. This will be reported via the LDF in February 2011. Initial results indicate potential for large scale standalone low carbon technologies including technologies such as wind and combined heat and power. The report also estimated a potential low carbon / renewable energy generation capacity for the City and how many jobs could be created through generating such low carbon energy.

In addition, funding for the Urban Eco Settlement on the British Sugar site is currently being used to undertake a detailed feasibility study into renewable energy.

Green Business Club and Sustainability4Yorkshire continuing to offer events for York businesses to support them to reduce their carbon emissions. An event is planned for 25<sup>th</sup> January and 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2011.

In conjunction with the Energy Saving Trust (EST) /Sustainability4Yorkshire, a renewable energy showcase was held in November in York.

Proposals for the development of an environment business support programme presented in outline to the York Economic partnership in November with further presentations to follow to the York Business Forum in March 2011. Regional programme designed to help local businesses tackle climate change & save money through resource efficiency tools, on-line portal/website and up - skilled local authority officers. Tools include:

- Support Website
- Resource efficiency voucher (Free consultancy advice)
- Events and training (including LA officers training)
- Diagnostic tools for businesses

Ongoing work on the LDFs Core Strategy's Vision and chapters to embed sustainable, low carbon development across York. (This will include a chapter(s) on Sustainable Resource Use, Climate Change, Renewable Energy and Carbon Reduction Targets). Extensive work have been undertaken to determine how to achieve the city's various carbon reduction targets. Work will now be undertaken into the detailed feasibility of delivering such targets.



#### 3.2. Exercise powerful leadership:

On-going work with CYCs Carbon Management Programme. To date we have saved an estimated 1995 tonnes of carbon. On-going work also includes detailed feasibility into wind turbines on appropriate CYC sites.

On-going work on CYCs 10:10 campaign (will save approx. 1200t of Co2 in 2010).

The Climate Change Framework and Action Plan have been approved by Executive and will be live from February 2011.

Ongoing work to understand and determine the requirements on York to deliver its Covenants of Mayors Commitments (CoM). As above, modeling has just been completed to support the creation of a Sustainable Energy Action Plan (SEAP). This submission will be made to CoM in April 2011. A paper will firstly go to Executive in early April.

Ongoing work with EST to support residents to save energy, gain financial assistance with grants and install renewable energy.

Carbon modeling study – work completed to inform the Climate Change Framework and Action Plan in December 2010. This identifies how the City can potentially reach its various carbon commitments.

#### 3.3 Recent funding updates:

Climate for Change CVS programme - A new series of workshops for the CVS in York and North Yorkshire on low carbon practices and operations (total £12,000).

Aims:

- explore how climate change and energy issues can impact on organisations in the short and medium term
- offer practical advice on how to reduce costs, to ensure that the organisation continues its purpose and meets its goals
- show how reducing waste can save money, strengthen community links, improve self esteem and the health and wellbeing of staff and service users.
- On-line Toolkit for organisations to use.

Climate change risk assessments for York and North Yorkshire -

A sub-regional programme including two seconded, part-time officers to work for a total of 6 months to (1) undertake a comprehensive risk assessment for climate change adaptation



work in partnership across Councils in York & North Yorkshire and (2) disseminate the results of this work both within the Y&NY Authorities and their partners, to create an individual council adaptation action plan to continue the adaptation work post March 2011in York and North Yorkshire Authorities and partners. (total £15,000).

#### Climate Change Skills Fund

In the Yorkshire and Humber Region we have been given £860,000 by CLG to deliver climate change programmes by June 2011. The main thrust of the programme is around supporting the role that Planning can play in delivering climate change mitigation and adaptation work. An initial set of project areas have been drawn up. The key areas of work are:

- Leadership and Skills covering elected members and planning officers and related professions (accredited training).
- Planning Policy work area to focus on policy development, e.g. further streamlining of permitted development rights, supporting LAs to deliver their planning policy targets (e.g. % of renewables in new developments), improve transparency of decision making and reducing appeals.
- Best Practice Hub focus on built environment best practice mitigation / adaptation work and learning.
- Citizen Engagement working with Energy Savings Trust to support householders in realising the benefits of renewables, how to get them installed, and being well adapted to a changing climate.
- Historical Assets Improving planning policy to improve energy efficiency and renewable energy generation in historical / listed buildings and conservation areas.

To date, CYC is leading on the Citizen Engagement fund for York and North Yorkshire, and in partnership with the SEI and Sustainability4Yorkshire, will be bidding for £70,000 to achieve the following in:

• Based on a successful pilot in York, and utilising the expertise of Sustainability4Yorkshire, a North Yorkshire Green Neighbourhood challenge will work with 7 community groups across the region(including a community in York). The challenge will involve 7 teams in North Yorkshire competing to reduce their carbon footprint for financial rewards that can then be used by the group to carry on further work in this area or to look at wider community improvement projects. The project aims to achieve a measurable reduction in household carbon emissions, raise public awareness of low carbon lifestyles and foster community cohesion.

Leeds City Region – Low Carbon Framework

This £3m (over 10 pilot areas) programme includes five key projects:



- Low Carbon Economic Analysis Mini-stern report looking at the costs and economic opportunities of policy responses to climate change.
- Low Carbon Innovation Linking with the LCR's Innovation Programme open innovation events leading to the development of an innovation competition for low carbon technologies.
- Domestic Energy & Efficiency Programme (DEEP) Includes the delivery of a DEEP pilot area and cost benefit analysis.
- Commercial Property A feasibility study looking at a potential revolving loan fund to incentivise energy efficiency retrofit on commercial properties.
- Renewable Energy Strategies Piloting local renewable energy strategies in two of the Urban Eco Settlement locations, including the production of local investment prospectuses that to facilitate discussions with communities and business.

CYC is piloting some of this work via the Domestic Energy & Efficiency Programme (DEEP) and Renewable Energy Strategies strands of this programme.

#### 4. Enterprise

- 4.1 Outline enterprise strategy, with potential to include a green jobs theme, presented to the York Economic Partnership in November. Further work underway to prepare a 3 year action plan.
- 4.2 Enterprise training, focussed on a green theme, supported by the Council, Science city York and NYBEP underway covering Year 9 pupils across secondary schools in the City.

#### 5. North Selby Mine

5.1 An update will be provided at the meeting – currently awaiting further comments from Science City York.

#### 6. Science City York –biorenewables demonstrator facility

6.1. Science City York are seeking to establish an international centre for excellence in biorenewables technology, to develop biorenewable feedstocks to replace a wide range of petroleum-based products. This is in partnership with a number of private sector partners, including Unilever, GSK and Croda. The project will be mainly delivered within the FERA site at Sand Hutton. An application to support this is being made to the first round of the Regional Growth Fund in January with endorsement from the York Economic Partnership and the Leeds City Region. Projected outputs from the proposal are the creation of 200 new jobs with 300 jobs safeguarded, 30 new businesses created, 135 level 2 and 3 skills and 135 level 4 skills.

#### YORK GREEN JOBS SURVEY - Quantitative Results

2. People mean many different things when they refer to green jobs. What do you understand by the term 'green jobs'? (tick the box that you think applies most)

	answered question skipped question	60 1			
		Response Percent	Response Count		
Jobs which are increasing due to towards a lower-carbon economy		23.3%	14		
Jobs done in a greener way that providing a similar product or s		25.0%	15		
Jobs in agriculture or renewable e	energy	0.0%	0		
Jobs which are carbon neutral	act aim to	5.0%	3		
Jobs which are in organisations the preserve or restore the environmental the future		13.3%	8		
Jobs which themselves aim to pre- restore the environment now and	in the future	20.0%	12		
An intentionally vague term which to account for the potential of incremployment opportunities	•	11.7%	7		
Other (please specify)		1.7%	1		

3. How much of your workforce do you think would consider themselves as doing a green job?

	answered question		60
	skipped question		1
		Response Percent	Response Count
None		41.7%	25
Under 10%		28.3%	17
11 - 25%		13.3%	8
26-50%		5.0%	3
51-75%		5.0%	3
76-100%		6.7%	4

4. Do any jobs, services or products in your business relate to preserving or restoring the environment now and in the future? IF NO GO TO QUESTION 9.

	ered question ped question	56 5_			
		sponse ercent	Response Count		
Yes, our core business relates to preser restoring the environment now and in the	e a v	% 5	5		
Yes, over a quarter of the workforce	3.69	% 2	2		
Yes, around 10 - 20% of the workforce	12.	5% 7	7		
Yes, but only a few jobs	26.8	3% 1	15		
No (go to question 9)	48.2	2% 2	27		

5. Do you anticipate an increase in employees working in these areas in the next 10 years? IF NO, GO TO QUESTION 7.

sponse
Count

6. Is this increase likely to mainly be new jobs or 'greening' existing roles?

answered question 20 skipped question 41

	compress queenen	Response Percent	Response Count
New jobs		25.0%	5
'Greening' existing roles		70.0%	14
Don't know		5.0%	1

7. What are the factors that will affect the extent of this growth (both positively and negatively)? (tick all that apply)

answered question 34 skipped question 27

	Response Percent	Response Count
Existing Skills	29.4%	10
Availability of the necessary skills locally	20.6%	7
National politics	52.9%	18
Local Politics	41.2%	14
Growth of competitors	17.6%	6
Land availability / planning permission	14.7%	5
Demand for green products and services	73.5%	25
Other (please specify)	11.8%	4

9. Do you think delivering the service(s) or product(s) your business provides in a greener way than your competitors would provide a competitive advantage?

answered question 60 skipped question 1 Response Response Percent Count No, it makes no difference to our customers 16.7% 10 Yes, but only because of the economic impact upon the 3.3% 2 introduction of carbon trading Yes, it would provide a some advantage, but other 70.0% 42 factors are more important to our customers 6.7% Yes, it would provide a significant advantage 4 Don't know 3.3% 2

# 10. What do you think the Council and its partners should be doing to increase the potential for green jobs in your business and in York? answered question 60

skipped question 1

	Response Response	
	Percent Count	
Supporting green business clubs / forums	35.0% 21	
Encouraging green skills development	46.7% 28	
Incentivising green businesses / jobs	58.3% 35	
Other ideas	38.3% 23	